



JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION

Eighty-eighth Session

FAO headquarters, Rome, Italy

14-18 July 2025

CRITICAL REVIEW - PART II¹

Note: For general information about the critical review and the critical review for CCAFRICA23, CCNASWP17 and CCFFV23 please see CX/EXEC 25/88/2. For the critical review for CCMAS44, and CCGP34, please see CX/EXEC 25/88/2 Add.2.

1. Structure of appendices

The work of the different committees is addressed in separate appendices. The structure of the appendices for each committee is as follows:

1. General information on the committee and session
2. Overall comments (Codex Secretariat/Chairperson)
3. Status of work items (Overview)
4. Specific comments on individual work items (Codex Secretariat/Chairperson)

2. List of appendices

Appendix 1: Codex Committee on Food Additives, 55th session (CCFA55)

Appendix 2: Codex Committee on Cereals, Pulses and Legumes, 11th session (CCCPL11)

¹ This document addresses CCFA55 and CCCPL11.

Appendix 1

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Food Additives (CCFA)		
Host	China	Chairperson	Dr. Yongxiang FAN
Co-host	Republic of Korea	Co-chairperson	Ms. Hae-Jung Yoon
Session reported on	CCFA55	24-28 March 2025	
Next Session	CCFA56	13-17 April 2026	
Report	REP25/FA		

2. Overall comments

Codex Secretariat's comments:

CCFA55 was successfully held with representatives from 46 Member countries, one Member Organization, and 24 Observer organizations attending the session.

CCFA55 was co-hosted by the Republic of Korea, which provided invaluable support to ensure its success.

In preparation for the plenary discussions, two physical working group (PWG) meetings were held addressing the *General standard for food additives* (GSFA) (CXS 192-1995) and Endorsement/Alignment, respectively. Additionally, two in-session working group (IWG) meetings were held on the priority list and the international numbering system (INS), respectively. These meetings were all critical to progressing the work and helped ensure CCFA55 was constructive and productive. Several new or revised food additive provisions were forwarded to CAC48 for adoption. The priority list of substances proposed for evaluation by JECFA was forwarded for endorsement.

In terms of work management, CCFA55 considered topics related to avoiding divergence between the GSFA, Codex commodity standards, and other texts, as well as the future work of CCFA, and agreed on the approaches to further advance these tasks.

CCFA55 also discussed and agreed to further develop the draft standard for baker's yeast and a new work proposal on developing a guideline for the conduct of food safety assessment of cell culture media components used in the production of cell-based foods.

All agenda items were thoroughly discussed and consensually concluded.

Chairperson's comments:

CCFA55 marked important progress toward strengthening Codex standards framework. CCFA55 submitted more than 500 food additive provisions for adoption, and by advancing work on the GSFA, reinforced its role as the single reference for food additive provisions in Codex. Continued alignment with commodity standards also contributed to reducing inconsistencies and enhancing coherence.

A key achievement was the focused discussion on the working practices and the engagement plan to avoid divergence between the GSFA, commodity standards and other related Codex texts. In response, CCFA55 agreed to continue to develop a stand-alone working practices for the development of GSFA provisions relating to commodity standards, and to design templates for use by commodity and coordinating committees. These efforts aim to improve the coherence of food additive provisions in GSFA and commodity standards.

A new work proposal on guidelines for the food safety assessment of cell culture media components used in the production of cell-based foods was discussed. CCFA55 also engaged in a forward-looking exchange on its future work priorities.

I would like to thank all participants for their active engagement and spirit of cooperation, and look forward to building on this momentum at CCFA56.

3. Status of work items

Topic	Recommendation of CCFA55
For decision by the Commission	
1. Draft Specifications for the identity and purity of food additives for inclusion in the <i>List of Codex specifications for food additives</i> (CXA 6-2024)	Adoption at Step 5/8
2. Draft food-additive provisions of the <i>General standard for food additives</i> (GSFA, CXS 192-1995) and revisions to adopted provisions	Adoption
3. Draft revision of the <i>Class names and the International Numbering System for food additives</i> (CXG 36-1989)	Adoption at Step 5/8
4. Revised food additive provisions of the GSFA in relation to the alignment of five CCASIA standards; three CCNE standards; eight CCSCH standards; one CCFO standard; and one CCCPL standard.	Adoption
5. The revision to the reference to commodity standards for the GSFA Table 3 additives for food category 12.2.1 "Herbs and spices (ONLY SPICES)"	Adoption
6. Revised food additive sections of three CCASIA standards, three CCNE standards, eight CCSCH standards, and the <i>Standard for rice</i> (CXS 198-1995)	Adoption
7. Revised food additives provisions in the <i>Standard for pickled cucumbers (Cucumber Pickles)</i> (CXS 115-1981), <i>Standard for canned stone fruits</i> (CXS 242-2003); and <i>Standard for jams, jellies and marmalades</i> (CXS 296-2009)	Adoption
8. Amendment to the <i>Standard for food grade salt</i> (CXS 150-1985)	Adoption
9. Specified food additive provisions of the <i>GSFA</i> (CXS 192-1995)	Revocation
10. Specified draft food additive provisions of the <i>GSFA</i> (CXS 192-1995)	Discontinuation
11. Priority list of substances proposed for evaluation by JECFA	Endorsement
For monitoring	
12. Standard for baker's yeast (job number N13-2024, deadline 2027)	Step 2/3
13. New draft food additive provisions of the <i>GSFA</i> (CXS 192-1995)	Step 2
For information	
14. Draft stand-alone working practices for the development of GSFA food additive provisions relating to commodity standards and the development of templates to be used by the Commodity/Regional Committees to ensure the submission of comprehensive information	For consideration at CCFA56
15. New work proposal on the development of a guideline for the conduct of food safety assessment of cell culture media components used in the production of cell-based foods	For consideration at CCFA56
16. A discussion paper on the future work for CCFA	For consideration at CCFA56

4. Specific comments

1. Draft Specifications for the identity and purity of food additives for inclusion in the <i>List of Codex specifications for food additives</i> (CXA 6-2024), Paragraph 50(i), Appendix III
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward full specifications for the identity and purity of food additives to CAC48 for adoption at Step 5/8 for inclusion in the <i>List of Codex specifications for food additives</i> (CXA 6-2024).
Chairperson's comments: JECFA's excellent work provided a solid basis for an efficient and informed discussion at CCFA55. The plenary discussions made clear how important it is to have complete and high-quality data. All stakeholders are encouraged to stay involved in the development of specifications, especially for emerging substances, and to support JECFA by submitting timely and comprehensive data. This will help ensure that Codex standards remain credible and effective.
2. Draft food-additive provisions of the <i>General standard for food additives</i> (GSFA, CXS 192-1995) and revisions to adopted provisions, paragraph 109(i), Appendix VI, Part C
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48 for adoption the draft food additive provisions of the GSFA and revisions to adopted provisions.
Chairperson's comments: GSFA is the core work of CCFA. The dedicated work of the EWG and PWG of GSFA has been instrumental in thoroughly reviewing and revising the food additive provisions in the GSFA. The active engagement and constructive contributions of all participants, which have enriched the discussions and facilitated consensus, are highly appreciated. This ongoing work is essential in advancing the GSFA as the single reference for food additive provisions in Codex.
3. Draft revision of the <i>Class names and the International Numbering System for food additives</i> (CXG 36-1989), paragraph 123(i), Appendix X
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward the proposed revision to the <i>Class names and International Numbering System for food additives</i> (CXG 36-1989) to CAC48 for adoption at Step 5/8.
Chairperson's comments: INS is another pillar of CCFA. The work of the EWG and the IWG has been highly appreciated. CCFA reiterates the significance of maintaining an up-to-date and harmonized numbering system to support the consistent identification of food additives in Codex.
4. Revised food additive provisions of the GSFA in relation to the alignment of five CCASIA standards; three CCNE standards; eight CCSCH standards; one CCFO standard; and one CCCPL standard, paragraph 73(ii) a-e, Appendix VI, Part B.1 - B.5
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48 for adoption the revised provisions of the GSFA in relation to the alignment of: (i) five CCASIA standards: <i>Regional standards for fermented soybean paste</i> (Asia) (CXS 298R-2009), <i>non-fermented soybean products</i> (Asia) (CXS 322R-2015); <i>cooked rice wrapped in plant leaves</i> (Asia) (CXS 355R-2023); <i>edible sago flour</i> (Asia) (CXS 301R-2011) and <i>soybean products fermented with bacillus species</i> (Asia) (CXS 354R-2023). (ii) three CCNE standards: the <i>Regional standards for canned hummus with teheha</i> (Near East) (CXS 257R-2007); <i>canned fowl medames</i> (Near East) (CXS 258R-2007); and <i>teheha</i> (Near East) (CXS 259R-2007). (iii) eight CCSCH standards: <i>Standards for dried oregano</i> (CXS 342-2021); <i>dried roots, rhizomes and bulbs: dried or dehydrated ginger</i> (CXS 343-2021); <i>dried floral parts: cloves</i> (CXS 344-2021); <i>dried basil</i> (CXS 345-2021); <i>dried or dehydrated garlic</i> (CXS 347-2019); <i>dried floral parts – saffron</i> (CXS 351-2022); <i>dried seeds – nutmeg</i> (CXS 352-2022); and <i>dried or dehydrated chilli pepper and paprika</i> (CXS 353-2022).

(iv) the <i>Standard for edible fats and oils not covered by individual standards</i> (CXS 19-1981). (v) the <i>Standard for rice</i> (CXS 198-1995).
Chairperson's comments: Alignment represents among the most complex tasks undertaken by CCFA. CCFA acknowledges significant progress in harmonizing food additive provisions between the GSFA and five CCASIA, three CCNE, eight CCSCH, one CCFO, and one CCCPL commodity standards. CCFA55 expressed appreciation for the dedicated efforts of the EWG and PWG, as well as the constructive engagement of Members and Observers. Discussions highlighted the need for enhanced communication and collaboration with relevant commodity committees, whose feedback will be helpful to resolve complex issues. Ultimately, this alignment work reinforces CCFA's commitment to upholding the GSFA as the singular reference for food additive provisions within Codex.
5. The revision to the reference to commodity standards for the GSFA Table 3 additives for food category 12.2.1 "Herbs and spices (ONLY SPICES)", paragraph 73(iii), Appendix VI, Part B 3.3.1
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 also agreed to revise the reference to commodity standards for the GSFA Table 3 additives for food category 12.2.1 to "Herbs and spices (ONLY SPICES)"
Chairperson's comments: After careful consideration, CCFA55 agreed to the revision. The revision clarifies the scope and ensures consistency with the corresponding commodity standards.
6. Revised food additive sections of three CCASIA standards, three CCNE standards, eight CCSCH standards, and the <i>Standard for rice</i> (CXS 198-1995), paragraph 73(i), Appendix V, Part A
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48 for adoption the revised food additive sections of: (i) three CCASIA standards namely CXS 298R-2009, CXS 322R-2015, and CXS 355R-2023; (ii) three CCNE standards namely CXS 257R-2007, CXS 258R-2007, and CXS 259R-2007; (iii) eight CCSCH standards namely CXS 342-2021, CXS 343-2021, CXS 344-2021, CXS 345-2021, CXS 347-2019, CXS 351-2022, CXS 352-2022, and CXS 353-2022; and (iv) the <i>Standard for rice</i> (CXS 198-1995).
Chairperson's comments: The revision was the result of alignment work. Similar to the comments to item 4, I would like to express my appreciation to the progress of alignment work in the EWG and PWG. This work eliminates the divergence of food additive provisions in GSFA and the commodity standards, and reinforces the role of GSFA as the single reference for food additive provisions in Codex.
7. Revised food additives provisions in the <i>Standard for pickled cucumbers (cucumber pickles)</i> (CXS 115-1981); <i>Standard for canned stone fruits</i> (CXS 242-2003); and <i>Standard for jams, jellies and marmalades</i> (CXS 296-2009), paragraphs 83, 86 and 89, Appendix V, Part B
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward the revised food additive provisions in the <i>Standards for pickled cucumbers</i> (cucumber pickles) (CXS 115-1981); <i>canned stone fruits</i> (CXS 242-2003); and <i>jams, jellies and marmalades</i> (CXS 296-2009) to CAC48 for adoption.
Chairperson's comments: The Chairperson had no further comments.

8. Amendment to the <i>Standard for food grade salt</i> (CXS 150-1985), paragraph 21(i), Appendix XII
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48, for adoption, the amendment to the sections for the labelling provisions of non-retail containers and the provision of the methods of analysis and sampling in the <i>Standard for food grade salt</i> (CXS 150-1985) and to request inclusion of the method for the determination of sodium chloride described in CXS 150-1985 into the <i>Recommended methods of analysis and sampling</i> (CXS 234-1999).
Chairperson's comments: CCFA55 supported forwarding this amendment to CAC48 for adoption, recognizing its importance in enhancing clarity and consistency in labelling requirements. Furthermore, the inclusion of the sodium chloride determination method from CXS 150-1985 into the CXS 234-1999 is a valuable step toward harmonizing analytical methods in the general standard and commodity standard. I would like to commend the efforts of all contributors in finalizing this work and encourages its timely adoption.
9. The food additive provisions of the GSFA (CXS 192-1995), paragraph 109(ii), Appendix VII
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48 for revocation specified food additive provisions of the GSFA.
Chairperson's comments: The revocation is a result of GSFA work. The ongoing work on the GSFA is being conducted under strong and effective management, ensuring thorough progress and coordination.
10. Draft and proposed draft food additive provisions of the GSFA (CXS 192-1995), paragraph 109(iii), Appendix VIII
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48 for discontinuation the specified draft and proposed draft food additive provisions of the GSFA.
Chairperson's comments: The Chairperson had no further comments.
11. Priority list of substances proposed for evaluation by JECFA, paragraph 133(i), Appendix XI
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward for endorsement by CAC48, as well as to FAO and WHO for follow-up, the amended priority list of substances proposed for evaluation by JECFA.
Chairperson's comments: The priority list is one of the key works of CCFA, and the progress in the in-session working group has been highly appreciated. CCFA supports forwarding the amended priority list to CAC48 for endorsement, and to FAO and WHO for appropriate follow-up. This step ensures continued alignment between CCFA's decision-making and JECFA's scientific advice. CCFA recognizes the importance of maintaining an up-to-date priority list. Meanwhile, the length of the List also suggests enhanced resourcing for JECFA is imperative to address the workload effectively.
12. Standard for baker's yeast, paragraphs 153-155
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 noted that there were a number of technical issues that needed further consideration and clarification and thus agreed to return the proposed draft standard to Step 2 for redrafting.
Chairperson's comments: CCFA55 noted the valuable exchange of views on the proposed draft Standard for baker's yeast. While a number of technical matters remained unresolved, the discussions were marked by a strong spirit of cooperation and mutual respect among participants. CCFA55 also recognized that further clarification and refinement are needed to ensure the standard is practical, scientifically sound, and broadly applicable. In this context, CCFA55 agreed to return the draft to Step 2 for redrafting. And I would like to encourage continued collaboration in refining the text and looks forward to further progress at CCFA56.

13. New draft food additive provisions of the GSFA (CXS 192-1995), paragraph 109 (iv), Appendix IX
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 agreed to forward to CAC48 for information the food additive provisions proposed for inclusion in the GSFA, at Step 2.
Chairperson's comments: The new draft provisions will be considered in the GSFA PWG. This also reflected the dynamic nature of CCFA's ongoing efforts to refine the GSFA.
14. Stand-alone working practices for the development of GSFA food additive provisions relating to commodity standards and templates to be used by the commodity/regional committees to ensure the submission of comprehensive information, paragraphs 161 and 162
Status and Secretariat's comments: The main aim of this work is to systematically align the food additives provisions within the commodity standards with those of the GSFA. The co-authors of the discussion paper had proposed the following two options to CCFA55: (1) Commodity/regional committee prepares the first draft of the provisions; (2) CCFA prepares the first draft of the provisions, along with two annexes titled "Key considerations for the development of the commodity standard and for the amendment of the GSFA" and "Communication and engagement plan". CCFA55 agreed to: (i) prepare draft stand-alone working practices, including the two options identified in CX/FA 25/55/12 as alternative routes, for the development of GSFA food additive provisions relating to commodity standards, including a communication and engagement plan; and (ii) develop templates to be used by the commodity/regional committees to ensure the submission of comprehensive information.
Chairperson's comments: This is a key step toward the systematic alignment of food additive provisions across Codex commodity standards and the GSFA, ensuring consistency and coherence in Codex texts. The two proposed procedural options offer flexibility while maintaining a structured and transparent approach. CCFA particularly values the inclusion of the "Key considerations" and "Communication and engagement plan" annexes, which will help guide the process and facilitate effective coordination. The agreement to develop templates for use by commodity and coordinating committees will further support the submission of complete and well-structured information. Therefore, I would like to encourage all Codex Members and Observers to actively engage in this important work and contribute their experience and perspectives. Continued communication and collaboration between CCFA and other committees remain essential in the process. We look forward to further progress based on this collaborative foundation.
15. The new work proposal on the development of a guideline for the conduct of food safety assessment of cell culture media components used in the production of cell-based foods, paragraphs 173-175
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCFA55 noted support on the need to consider the establishment of Codex guidance on this type of new food sources and production system (NFPS) to ensure consumer safety and facilitate fair practices in the food trade and the need to review the project document and the lack of unanimous support to start new work. CCFA55 agreed that further consultation be undertaken with a view to improving the project document. CCFA55 also agreed to establish an EWG to discuss and improve the project document for the development of a guideline for the conduct of food safety assessment of cell culture media components used in the production of cell-based foods. This item would be included in the provisional agenda for CCFA56.

Chairperson's comments:

There was thorough and constructive discussion in plenary on the new work proposal for the development of a guideline on the conduct of food safety assessment of cell culture media components used in the production of cell-based foods. This exchange demonstrated the growing interest of Codex Members and Observers in addressing emerging issues related to food sources and production systems. While recognizing the need for further refinement of the project document, CCFA appreciates the diverse perspectives shared and the shared commitment to advancing this complex area of work. I would like to encourage continued engagement and dialogue as this important topic evolves and looks forward to its further consideration under the provisional agenda of CCFA56.

16. A discussion paper on the future works for CCFA, paragraph 188**Status and Secretariat's comments:**

CCFA55 noted the broad support for the preparation of the document and recognized the importance of the topic on future work of CCFA.

CCFA55 agreed to request that Codex Secretariat issue a CL requesting systematic approach and topics for future work, and that the host secretariat prepare a discussion paper based on the responses to the CL for consideration by CCFA56.

Chairperson's comments:

In the discussion in the plenary, there was strong support expressed by Members and Observers for initiating a discussion on the future work of CCFA. This forward-looking exercise is essential to ensure CCFA remains responsive to emerging trends, technological advancements, and evolving global food systems. And this work also marks an important step in shaping a strategic vision for CCFA's continued relevance and effectiveness. In addition, this process will help identify priority areas, promote proactive planning, and foster broader engagement from Codex Members and Observers. We expect that all stakeholders contribute to this initiative and looks forward to a rich and inclusive dialogue at CCFA56. Such collaboration will be critical in guiding the future direction of CCFA and reinforcing its role in global food additive standard setting.

Appendix 2

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Cereals, Pulses and Legumes (CCCPL)		
Host	United States of America	Chairperson	Mr Kenneth Lowery
Session reported on	CCCPL11	7-30 April 2025	
Next Session	CCCPL12	2027 (TBC)	
Report	REP25/CPL		

2. Overall comments

Secretariat's comments:

CCCPL11 was successfully conducted working by correspondence, hosted by the United States of America, with representatives from 31 Member countries, one Member Organization, and one Observer organization attending the session.

CCCPL11 was dedicated to considering the need to establish an EWG to develop a group standard for whole millet grains, along with the specific Terms of Reference (ToRs) for the EWG. CCCPL11 agreed to establish the EWG, to be chaired by India and co-chaired by Mali, Nigeria and Senegal and agreed on the ToRs.

CCCPL11 was informed of the request from CCMAS43 regarding the provisions for ash content and the request from CAC44 regarding provisions for labelling for non-retail containers in CPL standards. CCCPL11 agreed to consider these issues at CCCPL12.

Chairperson's comments:

CCCPL11 was tasked by CAC to establish an EWG for a group standard for whole millet grains, and establish the Terms of Reference for that EWG, which it successfully did via correspondence.

During the session, Members raised the desire to update and/or revise the *Standard for wheat and durum wheat* (CXS 199-1995). It was recommended that Members prepare new work proposals for consideration by CCCPL12 and as a committee working by correspondence (CWBC) this may require the authorization of CCEXEC and CAC for CCCPL to consider these new work proposals.

With regard to the matter referred from CCMAS regarding ash in CPL standards, this was deferred until CCCPL12. Similarly, the issue of labelling provisions for non-retail containers in CPL standards was also deferred to CCCPL12.

Given the complexity of the subjects that CCCPL12 will have under discussion and the constraints posed by working via correspondence, it is recommended that CCCPL12 be given the flexibility to constitute virtual working groups if necessary for delegates to reach consensus.

3. Status of work items

For monitoring			
Topics	Job No.	Target year	Step
1. A group standard for whole millet grains	N21-2024	2028	2

4. Specific comments

1. A group standard for whole millet grains, paragraphs 24 and 25
Status and Secretariat's comments: CCCPL11 agreed to establish an EWG chaired by India and co-chaired by Mali, Nigeria and Senegal, working in English and French, with the following ToRs to: (i) determine the structure of the group standard by identifying the most appropriate approach to accommodate the diversity of millets and address the specific needs of international markets, taking into account that the structure should also be potentially applicable to other cereals in the future; (ii) set minimum quality and safety requirements that can serve as a single and consistent reference point for all types of millet grains, ensuring alignment with Codex principles and global trade practices; (iii) determine the scope of the standard, including the types of millets to be included in the standard, whether and how to include existing millet standards, and whether or not pseudo-millets should be included; and (iv) prepare a comprehensive report summarizing the findings, conclusions, and recommendations, along with a draft group standard. CCCPL11 noted that the EWG could take into consideration the approach to group standards developed by other Codex committees, where applicable and appropriate, and that the EWG report should be submitted to the Codex Secretariat at least three months before CCCPL12. Chairperson's comments: CCCPL11 was highly successful in completing its main task, due in large part to the Members working together and making concessions in the interest of the larger group when necessary.